

# Replacement Reincarnation

In replacement reincarnation, a person remembers the life of someone who died after he or she was born. In psychical research, these cases have been called anomalous-date cases, possession, and *parakaya pravesha*, a Hindi term that indicates a wandering spirit that takes possession of a living body. Unlike what in popular parlance are called walk-ins, replacement reincarnation brings with it an abrupt and complete change of personality, memory, and self-identification.

## Possession or Reincarnation?

Ian Stevenson, a twentieth century pioneer of reincarnation research, held that the difference between possession and reincarnation 'lies in the extent of displacement of the primary personality achieved by the influence of the "entering" personality'.<sup>[1]</sup> He described a continuum of possession states, from an over-shadowing influence in the Thompson-Gifford case<sup>[2]</sup>, through the thirteen-week possession of [Lurancy Vennum](#) by Mary Roth,<sup>[3]</sup> to a longer term possession by the spirit of a deceased person in the case of Jasbir Jat<sup>[4]</sup> (described below).

Stevenson's definition of possession as 'displacement of the primary personality' led him to include reincarnation cases with intermissions (intervals between death and rebirth) of under nine months in length as instances of possession, on the assumption that the 'primary personality' connected with its body at conception.<sup>[5]</sup> However, this assumption may not be warranted. In some animistic tribal cultures, stillbirths are said to occur when no spirit has attached itself to the body, and it may be that a spirit can join a body at any point during gestation without necessarily displacing one that was there before it.<sup>[6]</sup>

James Matlock proposes defining 'possession' as 'the occupation of a body by a spirit', which would allow all reincarnation to be considered possession, albeit a relatively long-term or permanent possession. When a reincarnation is terminated and superseded by another reincarnation in the same body, we may appropriately speak of 'replacement reincarnation'. In the majority of cases that have come to the attention of researchers, the replacement occurred after birth, hence it is 'postnatal replacement reincarnation'. Replacement in the womb is theoretically possible with intermissions of under nine months, and may be termed 'prenatal replacement reincarnation'. There are in addition a few cases in which the replacement was planned before death or intentionally induced, 'planned' or 'induced replacement'.<sup>[7]</sup> This article adopts Matlock's terminology.

## Replacement Reincarnation vs Walk-Ins

Replacement reincarnation may easily be confused with what are popularly called walk-ins, and the terms are sometimes assumed to be synonymous.<sup>[8]</sup> However, there are significant differences between the replacement phenomenon and walk-ins.

As the examples of replacement reincarnation described below show, replacement involves a fairly abrupt and complete substitution of one controlling spirit by another. Personalities and memory streams are irrevocably altered. Moreover, the replacing personalities are those of other regular people, then recently deceased. Replacement reincarnation has been described in societies around the world, from as early as eighteenth century China.

The American writer Ruth Montgomery introduced the walk-in phenomenon in her 1979 book, *Strangers Among Us*.<sup>[9]</sup> She described walk-ins as "enlightened beings" which take possession of human bodies with the mission of helping repair lives and lead humanity into a new age of spiritual progress. Walk-ins introduce new personalities and interests, but do not entirely displace the old memory streams, which are retained due to their instantiation in cellular memory. Walk-ins negotiate their entry with the 'walk-out' and only enter with permission, but afterwards, walk-ins are not aware of who they are. Montgomery identified walk-ins of the past as including Abraham Lincoln, Emanuel Swedenborg, and Mahatma Gandhi.<sup>[10]</sup>

Although this concept of walk-ins as enlightened beings continues to be promoted in popular writings,<sup>[11]</sup> one also now finds the idea that they may be regular people, who wish to continue their lives, but not necessarily with the goal of helping mankind. In one recent book, the walk-in is said to be an old boyfriend of the author, who takes over her husband's body with his permission.<sup>[12]</sup> Unlike replacement reincarnation, purported walk-in claims have yet to be studied by psychical researchers. Although the concept is well known in the popular sphere, its evidential status is unclear.<sup>[13]</sup>

## Postnatal Replacement Reincarnation

## Introduction to Postnatal Replacement Reincarnation

Postnatal replacement reincarnation happens when the spirit which has been with a body from birth is supplanted by another spirit, bringing with it a radical change of personality and self-identification. These cases are rare, yet may be more common than is realized. By 2001, Stevenson knew of ten cases of this type,<sup>[14]</sup> and others have come to light since then.<sup>[15]</sup> Jürgen Keil, who investigated reincarnation cases in Turkey, Thailand, and Myanmar, says that he heard of 'something like 30 to 50' of them.<sup>[16]</sup> Unfortunately, Keil tells us nothing about these cases, except for noting that in one of the Turkish ones, the child subject was 15-18 days old when the replacement occurred.<sup>[17]</sup> A possible Sri Lankan case is mentioned by Nissanka<sup>[18]</sup> and a Lebanese Druze case by Littlewood<sup>[19]</sup>, but too briefly to assess.

Three of the ten replacement cases summarized below (Ruprecht Schulz, Jaspar Jat, and Sumitra Singh) were investigated in depth and reported in the scholarly literature. Accounts of two others (Juta and Sudhakar Misra) were presented more briefly by their investigators. There is uncertainty about the Hungarian case of Iris Farczády, which began in the 1930s, with its most recent investigators disagreeing about how best to interpret it, perhaps in part because they were aware of only one other case (Sumitra Singh) with which to compare it. The English case of Dorothy Eady, or Omm Sety, although well-known, has been treated only in popular sources. All except the last two Chinese cases are from the twentieth century. The ten cases are presented in the order of the case subject's age at replacement.

The length of time from birth until replacement varies from a day or so to several years.<sup>[20]</sup> In the majority of known cases, the replacement came by three years of age, whereas in two of them, it came in the teens. The replacement is often marked by severe, apparently terminal, illness, from which the subject unexpectedly recovers. Old personalities disappear and are replaced by radically different personalities. The subjects identify themselves by different names and feel confused and out of place in what they claim are their new conditions. In most cases of this sort, the replacing personalities give enough information about the people they believe themselves to have been that these people can be traced, and are found to have died shortly (usually a few months) before the replacement transpired. With older subjects, the replacement (or permanent possession) may be preceded by a succession of temporary possessions.

### Ruprecht Schulz (Germany)

Ruprecht Schultz investigated his own case and related it to German newspapers, whose stories brought it the attention of researchers. Hans Bender and Karl Müller, as well as Ian Stevenson, looked into it, and Stevenson described it in *European Cases of the Reincarnation Type*.

Ruprecht was five weeks old when the man whose life he recalled killed himself, but there is no mention of whether he suffered any illness around that time. As a child, he sometimes pointed to his temple with his finger extended as if it were a gun and said, 'I shoot myself.' He had a keen interest in ships and shipping, and collected pictures and models of ships, a rather odd hobby for someone living in Berlin. As an adult, he started his own business, but was risk-averse, known among his friends to be 'security conscious'. These behaviors, interests, and attitudes fell into place when he discovered his previous identity.

He was already in his 50s, faced with a situation of withdrawing account books from a wall safe night after night. He had the feeling he had done this before, and asked himself when and where. After a while, images of a man dressed in fine clothes, perusing an account book, came to his mind. The man realized that he was ruined, took out a revolver, and shot himself. Ruprecht sensed that the man was involved in importing timber and that he lived in a seaside town. The memories included enough clues for him to figure out that he had been a timber importer and lumber merchant named Helmut Kohler. He tracked down Kohler's son, who confirmed his memories. Kohler had made a bad business decision and was in danger of bankruptcy, when he was robbed by his accountant, and killed himself as a result.<sup>[21]</sup>

### Juta (Thailand)

Juta, a Thai boy, was four months old when his mother's elder brother was killed in a traffic accident. Three or four months later, he contracted a respiratory illness and ran a high fever for several days, his body convulsing and his teeth chattering from chills. After he recovered, his family noticed two dark spots on his upper left arm. Almost triangular in shape and about a quarter of an inch across, the spots matched marks in the same place on his uncle's left arm. They were the start of a tattoo that had not been completed.

When he became old enough to talk, Juta called his grandparents 'Mother' and 'Father.' He called other members of the family by names appropriate to his uncle, and behaved in other ways like him. When his uncle's friends visited, Juta would play jokes on them, as the uncle had done. When he was two years old, he would say that said he worked for a construction

company in Bangkok, which was true for his uncle. He would point to his uncle's motorcycle and say it was his. These behaviors lasted until Juta was five, then subsided. The spots on his arm faded then, too.<sup>[22]</sup>

### **Sudhakar Misra (India)**

An Indian boy, Sudhakar Misra, was less than a year old when he became seriously ill. At one point, he was taken for dead, but recovered. His memories of an earlier life began to emerge when he was not quite three. He asked for shoes, which boys his age did not wear, and when told he could not have them, said that he would go to his previous house to get them. He insisted that his name was Vimal, not Sudhakar, and that he had a wife and daughter. His wife had covered him with a sheet when he was dying, and he had kissed her hand.

Sudhakar's parents did nothing to confirm what he was saying. Like many Indian mothers, his was afraid of losing him to the previous family, and tried to suppress his memories by turning him counter-clockwise on a potter's wheel. This ritual had no effect, however, and his father took him to one of his (the father's) cousin's clinics, which was on the way to the town in which Vimal had lived. The cousin had known Vimal and notified his family, who came to meet Sudhakar. Sudhakar recognized Vimal's widow, daughter, and other relatives. It turned out that Vimal had died of a heart attack six months after Sudhakar was born. Vimal's daughter asked if Sudhakar could come live with them, but his mother declined to let him go. Visits between the families were soon discontinued.<sup>[23]</sup>

### **Jasbir Jat (India)**

Another Indian boy, Jasbir Jat, was three and a half years old when he contracted smallpox and appeared to die. As it was then late at night, his burial was postponed until morning, but before it could be accomplished, he began to stir again. Jasbir could not speak for several days, and it was some weeks before he could express himself clearly. When he could talk, he claimed not to recognize his surroundings or anyone in the Jat family. He asserted that he was Sobha Ram, son of Shankar of Vihedi, and asked to go to that village. He had died, he said, when he was given poisoned sweets by a man who owed him money and fell off a chariot during a wedding procession travelling between villages.

The revived Jasbir insisted that he was Brahmin and refused to eat food prepared by the Jat family, who belonged to a lower caste. For almost two years, he would only knowingly eat things cooked in metal vessels by a kindly Brahmin neighbor. This woman's cooking for Jasbir and the details of his memories came to the attention of Sobha Ram's family in Vihedi, one of whom decided to visit Jasbir's village. Jasbir recognized this woman when he saw her, and she told the rest of Sobha Ram's family when she returned home. After that, Sobha Ram's father and other family members went to meet Jasbir, who recognized all of them and correctly identified their relationships to Sobha Ram. Sobha Ram's family confirmed the truth of what Jasbir had been saying, except for the alleged poisoning, about which they knew nothing.

Jasbir was allowed to visit Vihedi and continued to do so as he matured. He had recently been there before Stevenson's last interview with him, when he was 21. He told Stevenson then that he still had clear memories of Sobha Ram's life and death.<sup>[24]</sup>

### **Dorothy Eady (England)**

Dorothy Eady was born in England in January, 1904. When she was three years old, she fell down a flight of stairs and hit her head. She was unconscious when her mother reached her side. A doctor examined her with a stethoscope, performed other tests, and declared her dead, but when he returned an hour later with a nurse to wash and lay out her body, he found her sitting up and playing on her bed. This time he could find nothing physically wrong with her, apologized for his mistake, and left.

Dorothy survived her fall, but she was not the same Dorothy. She wept a lot and when her mother asked her why, she said she wanted to go home, although she didn't know where her home was. She began to have recurring dreams of a huge building with columns and a garden filled with flowers and fruits, near tall trees. The next year, she was taken on a trip to the British Museum, where she went wild in the Egyptian galleries, running through the rooms and kissing the feet of all the statues she could reach. Her fascination with ancient Egypt persisted into adulthood and she eventually moved to Egypt to work for the Ministry of Antiquities. She assumed the name Omm Sety and died in the city of Abydos in 1981. Her past identity was never determined, but all signs point to a life in the era of the pharaohs.<sup>[25]</sup>

### **Ca Hieu's Daughter (China)**

In December, 2010, the *Vietnam Post* published a brief account of an apparent case of replacement reincarnation that had

occurred in a southern Vietnamese village twenty years before. The 19-year-old daughter of a man named Ca Hieu of Ten Viet fell ill and died at around the time that a girl in another village, of an unspecified age but evidently quite young, became sick and appeared to die. She was about to be buried when she suddenly revived, claiming to be the daughter of Ca Hieu. She pleaded to go to Ten Viet to see him. Her parents were worried that she had gone mad, but in order to pacify her, took her to Ten Viet. The girl led them to what she said was her home. She ran into the house and embraced Ca Hieu, telling him, 'Dad, it's me!' Ca Hieu did not recognize the girl and was confused until her parents explained the situation. Meanwhile, she walked about the house comfortably and with familiarity, as if it were her own home.<sup>[26]</sup>

### **Iris Farczády (Hungary)**

The Hungarian Iris Farczády was a 15-year-old<sup>[27]</sup> Spiritualist medium who regularly became possessed by spirits, sometimes for periods that lasted beyond the séances. In 1933, she was taken over by a spirit who identified herself as a 41-year-old Spanish charwoman named Lucía Altarez de Salvio. Lucía did not leave Iris, as earlier communicators had done. She spoke Spanish, understood no Hungarian, and only gradually learned German, the language spoken by Iris's family. She said that she had died three months before in Madrid, leaving a husband and numerous children. After the transformation, Iris found a new talent in cooking and enjoyed singing Spanish songs and flamenco dancing. The case was investigated first by Karl Röthy<sup>[28]</sup>, then by Cornelius Tabori<sup>[29]</sup>, and most recently by Mary Rose Barrington, Peter Mulacz, and Titus Rivas<sup>[30]</sup>. Iris was nearly 80 at the time of the last interviews, but still identified herself as Lucía.

Researchers have never been able to find a record of Lucía in Madrid or elsewhere in Spain. Some people who came into contact with Lucía doubted that she really was from Madrid, although it was discovered that besides speaking Spanish responsively, and singing and dancing in a Spanish style, she was acquainted with devices that would have been appropriate to a Spanish woman at her station in life. Barrington, Mulacz, and Rivas asked her how she felt about displacing Iris. Tears came to her eyes as she recalled happily floating in space after her death. She had not asked or expected to be reborn, she said. She had no idea how she had come to replace Iris in her body, and believed that it was not her fault.<sup>[31]</sup>

### **Sumitra Singh (India)**

A young married Indian woman of 17, Sumitra Singh, began going into trances during which she seemed to be possessed by the goddess Santoshi Ma and others. She predicted her death in three days' time, and indeed, on the third day, appeared to die, then revived with a distinctly different personality. She now identified herself as another young woman, Shiva, and wanted to be called by that name. She said she had been murdered by her in-laws. She did not recognize anyone in Sumitra's life and for a while refused to care for her young son or to be a wife to Sumitra's husband.

Word of Shiva's reappearance reached Shiva's father, who went to Sumitra's home to check out the reports. Shiva recognized him and others of Shiva's family and friends in person and in photographs—23 of them altogether. Shiva was much better educated than Sumitra, and after she took over, Sumitra's manner of speaking changed and her literacy level improved substantially. She wrote several letters to Shiva's family that an expert judged to be closely similar to Shiva's handwriting when she was alive.<sup>[32]</sup>

Shiva related that after her death she had been taken before Lord Yama, the Hindu god of death. Santoshi Ma helped her by hiding her under the plank on which Yama sat, and feeding her. Yama at first said he would allow her another three years of life, in compensation of her premature death, but after the intercession by Santoshi Ma and Lord Hanuman, agreed to send her back for seven years.<sup>[33]</sup> In fact, Sumitra lived for thirteen years after her revival as Shiva. Except for a brief return of Sumitra's personality on one occasion, Shiva remained in control until the end of her life.<sup>[34]</sup>

This case was closely investigated by Stevenson and others. For a more extensive summary, see [Shiva/Sumitra](#).

### **The Hunter of Henan (China)**

The Chinese writer Pu Sonling included a replacement case in his book, *Strange Stories from a Chinese Studio*, first published in 1740. A young man from a wealthy family in Henan was out hunting hares with falcons when he fell from his horse, unconscious and apparently dead. As his servants gathered round him, he gradually regained his senses, but he didn't recognize them and was confused about why he was there. 'How did I get here?' he asked. 'I am a Buddhist priest.' Thinking he was merely delirious, his servants accompanied him home, but once there he reused wine and meat and avoided the society of his wife. Soon he set out for the monastery he believed was his true residence. When he reached there, he asked the monks what had happened to the priest he believed was himself. They told him that he had died suddenly at 80 years and showed them a new grave, in which his body was buried. The man went back to the rich youth's house, but despite his

attempts to live as a layman, he found he could not, and returned to the monastery. He explained to the monks what had happened and told him so many details of his priestly career that they accepted him as the old priest returned in the youth's body.<sup>[35]</sup>

## **Mrs Li (China)**

This last case, also from China, has the oldest subject of any recorded case of replacement reincarnation. In 1756, a married woman with the surname Li, thirty years old, appeared to die, due to what causes we are not told. Her husband went into a nearby town to buy her a coffin, but when he reached his home with it, was overjoyed to discover her still alive. However, when he went near her, she protested that he must not touch her. She was a Miss Wang, from another village, and was unmarried. How she got there, she did not know. Her frightened husband got in touch with the Wang family. It turned out that they had just buried an unmarried daughter and they went post haste to the Li house. The revived Mrs Li embraced them and told them so many things about her life as Miss Wang that they had no doubt that she had reappeared in Mrs Li's body. Miss Wang's fiance then came and Mrs Li blushed and showed that she recognized him also. Because she was claimed by both the Wang and Li families, the case was brought before a sub-prefect, who decided that she must be considered to be Mrs Li. <fn>Willoughby-Meade (1928), p. 9.

## **Prenatal Replacement Reincarnation**

### **Introduction to Prenatal Replacement Reincarnation**

There are many reincarnation cases with intermissions of under nine months in length, more from some cultures than others (see [Patterns in Reincarnation Cases](#)). We cannot know how often a replacement of spirit has occurred in these cases, or even if it has happened in them at all. However, when there are discrepancies between marks on the bodies of the case subjects and police or autopsy reports of the people whose lives they remember, as in the case of Toran (Titu) Singh, we may wonder if a prenatal replacement is involved.

## **Toran (Titu) Singh (India)**

At less than two years of age, Titu began speaking about the life and death of Suresh Verme, a vendor of transistor radios and player in the regional black market of Agra, India, who had been killed by a shot to the head. He wanted to go to Suresh's shop in Agra. An elder brother and his friend went there without taking him, and made contact Suresh's widow. She notified his birth family, several of whom went with her to meet Titu, who responded to the party with great excitement. When taken to the shop and other places known to Suresh, he recognized them, even as attempts were made to mislead him. Titu identified with Suresh intensely and was as active, intrepid, and hot-tempered as he had been.<sup>[36]</sup> He changed as he grew older, however. He studied yoga and became a university professor.<sup>[37]</sup> Titu's case is featured in [a video available on YouTube](#).

Titu has a birthmark on his forehead and a bony protrusion by his left ear, commemorating the fatal bullet's entry and exit points. He also has three smaller birthmarks on the back of his head, unrelated to Suresh. Although the date of Suresh's death is documented in police and medical reports, there is a question about Titu's birth date, so the length of the intermission between the lives is not known for sure. Titu's father thought that Titu was born three months after Suresh died, and if that is so, the three birthmarks on the back of his head may be associated with an earlier tenant of his mother's womb, evicted by Suresh in an impulsive desire to get back to avenge himself for his murder. Interestingly, Titu's mother had a normal pregnancy until her last trimester, but suddenly became sick and remained ill throughout that period.<sup>[38]</sup>

## **Planned and Induced Replacement Reincarnation**

### **Introduction to Planned and Induced Replacement Reincarnation**

There are reports from Tibet of replacement reincarnation that is planned in advance. Before Buddhism reached Tibet, rulers used replacement reincarnation to perpetuate their reigns by being reborn in younger bodies when their older ones wore out,<sup>[39]</sup> and this was continued in into historical times with both political and religious leaders, including the Dalai Lama. In several cases, the planned replacement reincarnation took place before the person died<sup>[40]</sup> and the current (14th) Dalai Lama has suggested that he might reincarnate into a named successor before his death.<sup>[41]</sup> In an exceptional case, a child successor was chosen after a lama's death and the replacement was induced by placing the child on the body of the deceased lama.<sup>[42]</sup>

## The Fourth Dalai Lama (Tibet)

In the summer of 1665, Bernier was told by a Tibetan physician that when his Grand Lama (the fourth Dalai Lama) 'was very old and on the point of death, he assembled the council, and declared to them that his soul was going to pass into the body of an infant recently born. The child was nourished with tender care; and when he had attained his sixth or seventh year, a large quantity of household furniture and wearing apparel was placed before him, mixed up with his own, and he had the sagacity to discern which part was his own property, and which was not; a decisive proof, the physician observed, how true is the doctrine of the transmigration of souls'.

## Karma Chagsmed Sprulsku (Tibet)

American anthropologist Marcia Calkowski learned about ten accounts of planned reincarnation said to have occurred before death. In two of these cases, the reincarnation was apparently into a child already living at the time. Karma Chagsmed Sprulsku gave evidence of having unusual abilities from a young age and was recognized as the sixth in the lineage of Karma Chagsmeds. When he grew old, he announced that the body of his next incarnation was a twelve-year-old boy to whom he had sent his mind emanation. This was confirmed in a meditative quest by the appropriate authority. The seventh Karma Chagsmed showed the same unusual abilities as had his predecessors.<sup>[43]</sup>

## 'Khrulzhig Rigpoche (Tibet)

In another of Calkowsky's cases, an elderly guru by the name of 'Khrulzhig Rigpoche one day visited a family who had a young son. There was an instant rapport between them, so 'Khrulzhig Rigpoche picked up the boy and put him on a seat, placed his amulets and rosary on the boy's lap, and sat back to observe him. He then announced that from that day forward, this boy was 'Khrulzhig Rigpoche. His mind had gone to the child, so henceforth people were to go to the boy for rituals, teachings, and consultations. His former body, however, lived for another two years.<sup>[44]</sup>

## Mé Thôn-Tsampo (Tibet)

An even more extraordinary event was observed by Jean-M. Rivière and reported in his 1929 book, *A l'ombre des monastères tibétains*. Rivière witnessed a ceremony at the death of the head of the Ky-rong Monastery, Lama Mé Thôn-Tsampo. An eight-year-old boy had been identified by 'astrologers and magicians' as the appropriate body for the lama's next incarnation. The boy was placed at the knees of the lama's embalmed body, and the two were covered with a veil. He uttered a cry, and when he emerged from under the veil, proclaimed that he was Lama Mé Thôn-Tsampo. There were noticeable changes in the boy's demeanor. Before he had looked afraid, but now he was in command. He discussed Buddhist doctrine and made prophecies. He was presented a group of objects as a test, and without hesitation picked out those that had belonged to the lama.<sup>[45]</sup>

## Understanding Replacement Reincarnation

The idea that one spirit may replace another in control of a body may seem strange and highly unlikely, but it is attested in these several cases from around the world. There is no agreement among commentators that the cases are what they seem to be, however. Barrington, Mulacz, and Rivas are divided over the best way to understand what happened to Iris Farczády. Barrington provisionally accepts it is a case of possession, but Mulacz shies away from the implication of postmortem survival and is content to declare the case a mystery, whereas Rivas favors dissociation plus cryptomnesia.<sup>[46]</sup> Braude thinks that dissociation plus a motivated super-psi is the answer for the Sumitra Singh and Jasper Jat cases, although he admits that that is more of a stretch in Jasbir's case, given how young he was when the change began.<sup>[47]</sup> Almeder,<sup>[48]</sup> Nahm,<sup>[49]</sup> and Matlock<sup>[50]</sup> accept the cases as possession or replacement reincarnation.

Matlock views reincarnation as possession by its nature and argues that whether we designate a case as involving possession or reincarnation should depend on how long the possession lasts. Reincarnation is simply a long-term possession. From this perspective, the short-term possessions that Iris Farczády experienced during her mediumship are 'possession,' whereas the lasting possession by Lucía counts as 'reincarnation'. Similarly, Santoshi Ma and the other spirits that manifested in Sumitra Sharma before the coming of Shiva possessed her, but Shiva reincarnated in her.<sup>[51]</sup>

Cases of replacement reincarnation closely resemble cases of reincarnation without replacement.<sup>[52]</sup> The same psychological identification with the previous person, veridical episodic memories of that person's life, and similarities of personality and behavior show up in both types of case. In both, there are procedural memories, such as Sumitra's improved literacy and Iris's ability to cook, sing, and dance in ways consistent with Lucía. There are recognitions of people



and places associated with the previous life in both types of case. There are some differences, though.

For the most part, physical carryovers are missing from postmortem replacement reincarnation, but minor effects like the spots on Jutá's arm may occur with replacement reincarnation. Memories appear to last longer with replacement reincarnation, especially when the replacement occurred at three years or later. Jasbir remembered Sobha Ram at least until he was 21, when Stevenson last saw him, and Sumitra Singh and Iris Farczády retained their memories until the end of their lives.

Postnatal replacements are usually, but not invariably, preceded by the subject's illness and apparent death. In one of Stevenson's as-yet-unpublished cases, the illness came after the replacement, rather than before.<sup>[53]</sup> There is no clear pattern to how replacement comes about, from the previous person's side. Lucía was content in her postmortem state, and could not say how or why she displaced Iris in her body. Sumitra said that Yama had allotted her another seven years of life. After reviving as Sobha Ram, Jasbir said that he had been led to Jasbir's body by a holy man.<sup>[54]</sup> The Tibetan planned replacement cases appear not to involve illness, but we have so little information about them these case we cannot sure what is going on in them.<sup>[55]</sup> The cases of replacement reincarnation that have been studied by psychological researchers offer no support for these suppositions.

James G. Matlock

## Literature

Barrington, M. R. (2005). 'The case of Iris Farczády—A stolen life': Correction. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*, 69, 232.

Barrington, M. R., Mulacz, P., & Rivas, T. (2005). The case of Iris Farczády—A stolen life. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*, 69, 49-77.

Bernier, F. (1914). *Travels in the Mogul Empire A.D. 1656-1658* (2nd ed). London: Humphrey Milford.

Braude, S. E. (2003). *Immortal Remains: The Evidence for Life after Death*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Calkowski, M. S. (2013). Arriving ahead of time: The *Ma 'das sprul sku* and issues of *sprul sku* personhood. *Journal of the International Association of Tibetan Studies*, 7, 340-364.

Chau, L. (2011, September 8). Stories of "reincarnation" in Vietnam. Retrieved from <http://www.talkvietnam.com/2011/09/stories-of-reincarnation-in-vietnam/>

Cott, J. (1987). *The Search for Omm Sety: A Story of Eternal Love*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.

Dayal, P. (1988). A case of soul transference (parkaya pravesh). In Proceedings of All India Conference on Reincarnation (March 28-29, 1987). Allahabad: Foundation for Reincarnation and Spiritual Research.

Haraldsson, E., & Matlock, J. G. (2016). *I saw a Light and Came here: Children's Experiences of Reincarnation*. Hove, United Kingdom: White Crow Books.

Hyslop, J. H. (1909). A case of veridical hallucinations. *Proceedings of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 3, 1-469.

Jaymes, C. (2017). *A Life by Request: A Walk-in Sou's Journey from Earth to Heaven, and Back Again*. East Greenwich, RI: Geronimo Publishing

Keil, J. (2010). Questions of the reincarnation type. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 24, 79-99.

Kingsley, P. (2010). *A Story Waiting to Pierce You: Mongolia, Tibet, and the Destiny of the Western World*. Point Reyes, CA: Golden Sufi Center.

Lane, E. (2007, Nov. 29). Dalai Lama says successor may not be from Tibet [web post]. Retrieved from <http://www.tibet.ca/en/library/wtn/479.html>

Littlewood, R. (2001). Social institutions and psychological explanations: Druze reincarnation as a therapeutic resource. *British Journal of Medical Psychology*, 74, 213-222.

- Matlock, J. G. (2017). Lecture 7: Signs of discarnate agency. Signs of Reincarnation online seminar course. <http://theazire.org/moodle>.
- Mills, A. (1989). A replication study: Three cases of children in northern India who are said to remember a previous life. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 3, 133-184.
- Mills, A., & Dhiman, K. (2011). Shiva returned in the body of Sumitra: A posthumous longitudinal study of the significance of the Shiva/Sumitra case of the possession type. *Proceedings of the Society for Psychical Research*, 59 (223), 145-193.
- Montgomery, R. (1979). *Strangers among Us: Enlightened Beings from a World to Come*. New York: Putnam.
- Muller, K. E. (1970). *Reincarnation—Based on Facts*. London: Psychic Press.
- Nahm, M. (2011). Reflections on the context of near-death experiences. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 25, 453-478.
- Nahm, M., & Hassler, D. (2011). Thoughts about thought bundles: A commentary on Jürgen Keil's paper "Questions of the reincarnation type." *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 25, 305-326.
- Nissanka, H. S. S. (2001). The history of rebirth research in Sri Lanka. In N. Senanayake (Ed.), *Trends in rebirth research: Proceedings of an international seminar* (pp. 13-21). Ratmalana, Sri Lanka: Sarvodaya Vishva Lekha.
- Pasricha, S. K. (1990). *Claims of Reincarnation: An Empirical Study of Cases in India*. New Delhi: Harman Publishing House.
- Perry, Y. (2013). *Walk-ins Among Us: Open your Personal Portal to Cosmic Awareness*. Nashville, TN: Write-On! Publishing.
- P'u, S. (1916). *Strange Stories from a Chinese Studio* (3rd ed.). Translated by Herbert Giles. <http://toddmcompton.com/GilesA.htm>,
- Rivière, J.-M. (1929/1981). *À l'ombre des monastères tibétains*. Milan, Italy: Archè.
- Semkiw, W. (n.d.). Past life story with a spirit being, raising of the dead & karma: Walk-In incarnation case of Sobha Ram | Jasbir Jat (web page). Retrieved February 11, 2018, from <http://www.iisis.net/index.php?page=reincarnation-walk-in-ian-stevenson-sobha-ram-jasbir-jat-walter-semkiw&>
- Stevens, E. W. (1887). *The Watseka Wonder: A narrative of startling phenomena occurring in the case of Mary Lurancy Vennum*. Chicago: Religio-Philosophical Publishing House.
- Stevenson, I. (1974). *Twenty Cases Suggestive of Reincarnation* (2nd ed., rev.). Charlottesville, VA: University Press of Virginia.
- Stevenson, I. (1997). *Reincarnation and Biology: A Contribution to the Etiology of Birthmarks and Birth Defects. Volume 1: Birthmarks*. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- Stevenson, I. (2001). *Children Who Remember Previous Lives: A Question of Reincarnation* (rev. ed.). Jefferson, NC: McFarland.
- Stevenson, I. (2003). *European Cases of the Reincarnation Type*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland.
- Stevenson, I., Pasricha, S. [K.], & McClean-Rice, N. (1989). A case of the possession type in India with evidence of paranormal knowledge. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*, 3, 81-101. (<https://med.virginia.edu/perceptual-studies/wp-content/uploads/sites/267/2015/11/STE29Stevenson-1.pdf>)
- Tabori, C. (1951/1967). The case of Iris Farczady: An unsolved mystery. *International Journal of Parapsychology*, 9, 223-226. Reprinted from *My Occult Diary*. London: Rider.
- Tucker, J. B. (2013). *Return to Life: Extraordinary Cases of Children who Remember Past Lives*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Willoughby-Meade, G. (1928). *Chinese Ghouls and Goblins*. London: Constable.



# References

## Footnotes

- 1.^ Stevenson (1974), p. 374.
- 2.^ Hyslop (1909).
- 3.^ Stevens (1887).
- 4.^ Stevenson (1974), pp. 374-377.
- 5.^ Stevenson (1974), p. 376.
- 6.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 7.11 n13.
- 7.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 7.11.
- 8.^ For instance, by Semkiw (n.d.)
- 9.^ Montgomery (1979)
- 10.^ Montgomery (1979), pp. 20-21.
- 11.^ Perry (2013)
- 12.^ Jaymes (2017).
- 13.^ Matlock (2017), p. 7-13.
- 14.^ Stevenson (2001), p. 127.
- 15.^ Tucker (2013), pp. 23-25; Keil (2010), p. 93.
- 16.^ Keil (2010, p. 93).
- 17.^ Keil (2010, p. 93).
- 18.^ Nissanka (2000), p. 17.
- 19.^ Littlewood (2001), pp. 216-217.
- 20.^ Stevenson (2001), p. 127.
- 21.^ Stevenson (2003), pp. 210-222.
- 22.^ Tucker (2013), pp. 23-25.
- 23.^ Pasricha (1990), pp. 104-109.
- 24.^ Stevenson (1974), pp. 34-52.
- 25.^ Cott (1987), pp. 11-12, 174.
- 26.^ Chau (2011).
- 27.^ Barrington (2005).
- 28.^ Warcollier, R. (1946). Un cas de changement de personnalité avec xénoglossie. *La métapsychique* 1940-1946, pp. 121-129.
- 29.^ Tabori (1951/1967).
- 30.^ Barrington, Mulacz, & Rivas (2005).
- 31.^ Barrington, Mulacz, & Rivas (2005), p. 57.
- 32.^ Stevenson, Pasricha, & McClean-Rice (1989); Mills & Dhiman (2011); Dayal (1988).
- 33.^ Dayal (1988), p. 60.
- 34.^ Mills & Dhiman (2010), p. 152.
- 35.^ P'u (1916), p. 13; Willoughby-Meade (1928), pp. 6-7.
- 36.^ Mills (1989).
- 37.^ Haraldsson & Matlock (2016), p. 195.
- 38.^ Haraldsson & Matlock (2016), pp. 194-195.
- 39.^ Kingsley (2010), pp. 137-138, 141.
- 40.^ Calkowski, 2013
- 41.^ Lane (2007).
- 42.^ Muller, 1970.
- 43.^ Calhowski, 2013, p. 342-343.
- 44.^ Calkowski, 2013, p. 345.
- 45.^ Rivière, J.-M. (1929/1981), as related in Muller (1970), p. 208.
- 46.^ Barrington, Mulacz, & Rivas (2005), pp. 68-76.
- 47.^ Braude (2003), p. 206.
- 48.^ Almeder (1992), pp. 143-150.
- 49.^ Nahm (2011), p. 464; Nahm & Hassler (2011), pp. 309-310.
- 50.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 7.10-7.13.
- 51.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 11.
- 52.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 7.13.

53.^ Stevenson (1997), p. 1068.

54.^ Stevenson (1974), p. 47.

55.^ Matlock (2017), Lecture 7: Signs of Discarnate Agency, p. 7/13.[/fn\

Clearly, replacement reincarnation is not the same thing as the walk-in phenomenon described by Ruth Montgomery in *Strangers among Us*. According to Montgomery, walk-ins are 'high-minded entities permitted to take over the bodies of human beings who wish to depart this life. Their mission is to lead us into an astonishing new age'.Montgomery (1979), jacket text.

© Psi Encyclopedia